Of particular concern is the fact that despite the passing of the ZNBC Amendment Act of 2002 which provides for, among other things, an independent board to oversee the activities of the national broadcaster, this act has yet to be implemented and ZNBC is still under government control.



ZAMBIA

OVERALL SCORE: 1.89

Zambia's position as measured by the MSI has slipped moderately during the year in review. In 2006-2007, the country was regarded as approaching sustainability (overall country score: 2.25), but it is now within an "unsustainable mixed system." MSI panelists suggest that, having made strides toward a more open media-friendly environment, the country is experiencing a reversion to conditions resembling those experienced under the socialist one-party United National Independence Party (UNIP) state. This time, however, media freedom has been limited through a mix of state-enabled oligarchic control and subtle as well as overt forms of intimidation.

The state controls two of the three daily and Sunday newspapers, The Zambia Daily Mail and The Times of Zambia. Of particular concern is the fact that despite the passing of the ZNBC Amendment Act of 2002 which provides for, among other things, an independent board to oversee the activities of the national broadcaster, this act has yet to be implemented and ZNBC is still under government control.

Zambian media houses are also exposed many forms of intimidation from government agencies and representatives. On March 30, 2007, officers from the Anti-Corruption Commission disrupted operations and sealed off the premises of Radio Mano, a community radio station in the Northern Province of Kasama.¹ The station manager, David Chanda, said officers produced a search warrant with no specific information regarding the goals of the search and termed the four-hour-long visit a "classified investigation."

In a second incident, Southern Province Minister Joseph Mulyata threatened to close the commercial radio station, SKY FM, for "unethical and unprofessional" conduct on May 4, 2007. The threat followed a program featuring Evangelical Fellowship of Zambia Executive Director Bishop Paul Mususu, who discussed Zambia's constitution-making process. Mulyata accused the station of propagating "anti-government views."

The country's minister of information and broadcasting services, Mike Mulongoti, made the most open display of state control of the media on September 10, 2007. In his address to trainee journalists at The Post newspaper, Mulongoti said the two state-owned newspapers should not criticize the government and that it is "unacceptable" for journalists working for these newspapers to do the same.

Three of the objectives for Zambia fell within the unsustainable mixed system category of the MSI, namely Objective 1, free speech (1.98), Objective 2, professional journalism (1.84), and Objective 4, business management (1.40). Those categorized as near sustainable were Objective 3, plurality of news sources (2.02) and Objective 5, supporting institutions (2.20). This is in contrast with the 2006-2007 review, where only Objective 4 fell within the unsustainable category while all others were regarded as approaching sustainability.

¹ MISA-Zambia Alert, April 4, 2007

ZAMBIA AT A GLANCE

GENERAL

- > Population: 11,669,534 (July 2008 est., CIA World Factbook)
- > Capital city: Lusaka
- > Ethnic groups (% of population): African 98.7%, European 1.1%, other 0.2% (CIA World Factbook)
- > Religions (% of population): Christian 50%-75%, Muslim and Hindu 24%-49%, indigenous beliefs 1% (CIA World Factbook)
- > Languages (% of population): English (official), major vernaculars: Bemba, Kaonda, Lozi, Lunda, Luvale, Nyanja, Tonga, and about 70 other indigenous languages (CIA World Factbook)
- > GNI (2007-Atlas): \$9.479 billion (World Bank Development Indicators, 2008)
- > GNI per capita (2007-PPP): \$1,220 (World Bank Development Indicators, 2008)
- > Literacy rate: 80.6% (male 86.8%, female 74.8%) (2003 est., CIA World Factbook)
- > President or top authority: President Rupiah Banda (since August 19, 2008)

MEDIA-SPECIFIC

- > Number of active print outlets, radio stations, television stations: Print: 14 newspapers; Radio Stations: 18; Television Stations: 3
- > Newspaper circulation statistics: Top three by circulation: *The Post* (circulation 27,500, privately-owned), *Zambia Daily Mail* (circulation 10,000, state-owned), *Times of Zambia* (circulation 14,000, state-owned)
- > Broadcast ratings: Top radio station: Radio Phoenix FM
- > News agencies: Zambia News and Information Service (state-owned), Palesa (private)
- > Annual advertising revenue in media sector: N/A
- > Internet usage: 334,800 (2005 est., CIA World Factbook)

MEDIA SUSTAINABILITY ONSUSTAINABLE ANTI-PREE PRESS AND A SOURCE PRESS

Unsustainable, Anti-Free Press (0-1):

Country does not meet or only minimally meets objectives. Government and laws actively hinder free media development, professionalism is low, and media-industry activity is minimal.

Unsustainable Mixed System (1-2): Country minimally meets objectives, with segments of the legal system and government opposed to a free media system. Evident progress in free-press advocacy, increased professionalism, and new media businesses

may be too recent to judge sustainability.

Near Sustainability (2-3): Country has progressed in meeting multiple objectives, with legal norms, professionalism, and the business environment supportive of independent media. Advances have survived changes in government and have been codified in law and practice. However, more time may be needed to ensure that change is enduring and that increased professionalism and the media business environment are sustainable.

Sustainable (3-4): Country has media that are considered generally professional, free, and sustainable, or to be approaching these objectives. Systems supporting independent media have survived multiple governments, economic fluctuations, and changes in public opinion or social conventions.

OBJECTIVE 1: FREEDOM OF SPEECH

Zambia Objective Score: 1.98

Overall the score for this objective remained unchanged from last year, although the decrease did pull it below the level for "near sustainability" into "unsustainable mixed system." Most indicator scores remained similarly unchanged, although Indicator 3 (market entry and taxation) received a somewhat higher score while Indicator 6 (libel laws) dropped modestly. Many of the indicators scored relatively close to the overall objective score, but there were four exceptions: Indicator 5 (preferential legal treatment and independence of state media) and Indicator 7 (access to public information) scored a half-point and a point lower than the objective score. On the opposite end of the scale, Indicator 8 (media outlets' unrestricted access to international news sources) and Indicator 9 (free entry into the journalism profession) both scored about three-quarters of a point higher.

Panelists felt that while Articles 20 (i) and (ii) of the Zambian constitution offered some guarantee of freedom of speech and expression, many laws still exist that limit these rights. Article 20 (iii) also allows for exceptions where freedom of speech and expression are viewed as contrary to the public interest or threaten national security. The article is regarded as vague and open to interpretation.

Therefore, freedom of the press is not currently expressly guaranteed in the constitution. The National Constitutional Conference (begun in December 2007) is revising the constitution, and panelists stressed the need for extensive lobbying for the inclusion of media-friendly provisions in the new document. Such protections would "to some extent allow journalists and other stakeholders to operate in a favorable environment, as democratic principles will be truly embraced to spearhead development," said Radio Lyambai station manager Mukeya Liwena. The outcome of the constitutional review, however, remains uncertain. This is the ruling Movement for Multiparty Democracy's (MMD) third attempt at reviewing the constitution since Zambia's return to multiparty democracy in 1991. Previous attempts have faltered following disputes over who has the power to endorse the new document.

Several incidents of state interference with the media during the past year highlight the need for constitutional protections. While suggesting that citizens did enjoy substantial freedoms, media law expert Patrick Matibini, from Pat Mat Legal Practitioners, warned that these needed to be safeguarded. Several examples of intolerant behavior were cited including:

Print media are particularly concerned about taxes imposed on both newsprint and advertising as both are taxed at 16 percent.

- A threat by Information and Broadcasting Services
 Minister Mike Mulongoti to revoke the license of a local
 commercial radio station, Petauke Explorers, in the Eastern
 Province of Zambia on May 17, 2007. The threat followed
 a program featuring a paid-for interview with Michael
 Sata, a vocal government opponent and leader of the
 opposition Patriotic Front (PF). The PF challenged the MMD
 domination of Zambian politics in the September 28, 2006
 tripartite elections.
- The Ministry of Information and Broadcasting Services ban on phone-in programs at Radio Lyambai in Mongu in December 2007.² In a letter to the station on November 30, 2007, the ministry's director of press and planning, Juliana Mwila, ordered that such programs be stopped while the station was investigated. Mwila alleged that the station had failed to handle calls professionally and had "become a platform for confrontation, controversies and a channel of insults and misinformation." Describing the ban as "an unforgivable attack on the Zambian constitution's guarantee of freedom of expression," MISA-Zambia Chairperson Henry Kabwe said it effectively prevented "Radio Lyambai listeners from expressing their views on critical social, economic and developmental issues in the Western Province."

For the indicator covering licensing of broadcast media, panelists observed that while two acts intended to reduce the government's control of the airwaves came into effect in 2003—the ZNBC Act and the Independent Broadcasting Act—neither has been fully implemented. These acts required the government to set up independent boards to oversee the public broadcaster and to regulate broadcasting, but these boards have yet to be constituted. Consequently, the regulation of broadcasting and the governance of the ZNBC still remain under the direct control of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting Services. The effect is that access to broadcast licenses remains at the minister's discretion, enabling politicians to issue threats of closure or withdrawal of licenses at will.

The panel agreed that how the judiciary dealt with freedom of expression issues depended greatly on the sensitivity of the cases before them. For instance, the Minister of Home

² MISA-Zambia Alert of December 7, 2007

Several incidents of state interference with the media during the past year highlight the need for constitutional protections. While suggesting that citizens did enjoy substantial freedoms, media law expert Patrick Matibini, from Pat Mat Legal Practitioners, warned that these needed to be safeguarded.

Affairs had signed a deportation order in 2006 for *Post* columnist Roy Clark because the government was not happy with the satirical articles he had been writing and publishing. In a classic show of its independence, the Supreme Court of Zambia overturned the order. Nothing of a similar nature happened during the year under review.

Regarding the indicator covering market entry and tax structure, panelists agreed that taxes in the country were too numerous and too high, especially for the print media. Print media are particularly concerned about taxes imposed on both newsprint and advertising as both are taxed at 16 percent. It was also observed that entry for print media was open, while this was not the case for broadcast media because of the lack of implementation of the Independent Broadcasting Authority and the continued role of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting Services. G TV, for example,

LEGAL AND SOCIAL NORMS PROTECT AND PROMOTE FREE SPEECH AND ACCESS TO PUBLIC INFORMATION.

FREE-SPEECH INDICATORS:

- > Legal and social protections of free speech exist and are enforced.
- > Licensing of broadcast media is fair, competitive, and apolitical.
- > Market entry and tax structure for media are fair and comparable to other industries.
- > Crimes against journalists or media outlets are prosecuted vigorously, but occurrences of such crimes are rare.
- > State or public media do not receive preferential legal treatment, and law guarantees editorial independence.
- > Libel is a civil law issue; public officials are held to higher standards, and offended parties must prove falsity and malice.
- Public information is easily accessible; right of access to information is equally enforced for all media and journalists.
- > Media outlets have unrestricted access to information; this is equally enforced for all media and journalists.
- > Entry into the journalism profession is free, and government imposes no licensing, restrictions, or special rights for journalists.

had many problems obtaining its operating license last year because civil servants under the control of politicians are still handling the issuance of licenses.

Regarding the coverage of crimes against journalists or media outlets, the panelists agreed that security for journalists depended on the nature of the assignment. Security was guaranteed for journalists covering pro-government or ruling-party activities, but this was not the case for journalists reporting on events organized by opposition parties or organizations critical of the government. They also remarked that the way in which the judiciary dealt with such matters depended on the case. A number of incidents involving threats, harassment and physical violence against media practitioners and their institutions have not been prosecuted, but the year under review experienced no physical violence against journalists.

Regarding the coverage of preferential legal treatment for, and editorial independence of, state media, the panel agreed that the state media (both print and electronic) are not editorially independent. Government appoints all heads of these institutions and, as Kabwe observed, "public journalists cannot bite the hand that feeds them." Community and private media have more independence, though they still face the threat of ministerial interference.

As for the indicator covering libel laws, panelists agreed that libel could be both a civil or criminal case. It was also noted that public officials are not held to a higher standard for having to prove falsity or malice. During the year under review, however, no journalists were prosecuted in terms of criminal defamation laws.

Journalists continue to struggle to obtain public information, and their ability to do so is compromised by the lack of access to information legislation. At the beginning of this year, the government promised to take back to parliament the Freedom of Information Bill that was withdrawn in 2002. To date, this has not been done. When it came to accessing international news and information from international news sources, however, panelists agreed that journalists faced few restrictions. The Internet is not regulated, and media houses can interview international news sources. Free-to-air and pay channels, such as those offered by MultiChoice, are available in the country, and journalists working for media houses who can afford these services have access to more than 10 international news channels.

It was noted that there were no restrictions for entering the journalism profession despite the government's attempts to oversee accreditation of journalists. The government views the current Media Ethics Council of Zambia (MECOZ) as powerless, mainly because not all journalists subscribe to it. Journalists,

in turn, argue that they are ethical and responsible enough to regulate themselves and that they believe that statutory regulation will infringe on the public's right to know and negatively affect some journalistic standards.

MECOZ does not register, license or accredit individual journalists. Its primary role is to enforce the code of conduct that media organizations and individuals voluntarily sign. On several occasions, the government has threatened to create its own regulatory body if the media fail to come up with one of their own.

OBJECTIVE 2: PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISM

Zambia Objective Score: 1.84

The score for this objective fell moderately from 2.15 to 1.84, with most of the loss coming from four indicators: Indicators 1 (objective and well-sourced reporting), 2 (journalism ethics), 4 (coverage of key events) and 6 (balance of entertainment and news). Indicator 5 (pay levels for journalists) improved somewhat but again received the lowest score of all indicators. All indicators scored within a half-point of the overall objective score.

This score declined from the previous year because, among other things, most panelists felt that a lot of untrained people had been attracted to the profession, coupled with corruption problems brought about by low salaries in the field. The panelists generally agreed that standards in the country are falling with journalists prone to receiving bribes from news sources, a practice that contributes to self-censorship. In addition, it was also accepted that many journalists fail to identify and cover key issues.

For the indicator covering fairness, objectivity and well-sourced reporting, it was observed that for all media, standards are again generally falling because often reporters leave many unanswered questions in their stories. The packaging of stories was also judged to be poor. Henry Kabwe added that the proliferation of unprofessional publications has had a negative effect with the government.

It was also generally acknowledged that the use of untrained volunteers, especially by community media, is contributing to problems of journalism quality because these people do not understand the ethical and professional requirements of the field. Premus Media's managing consultant, Edem Djokotoe, observed that working with the media requires a certain level of intelligence and extensive training.

It was noted that MECOZ, which was set up to monitor and respond to claims of unethical practice, does prescribe to a

It was also generally acknowledged that the use of untrained volunteers, especially by community media, is contributing to problems of journalism quality because these people do not understand the ethical and professional requirements of the field.

generally agreed-upon Code of Ethics for journalists, and has done so since the code was developed in July 2003. This code is currently under review. With the exception of *The Post* newspaper, all other major media institutions now subscribe to MECOZ, having accepted the code and its principles.

In its present form, MECOZ has no real power to enforce ethical practice. This is because it is a voluntary organization; members are not bound or even obliged to accept or respect MECOZ's rulings. To be effective, the members must be able to fund its activities. In addition, there is a need for a memorandum of understanding from all players undertaking to accept and abide by MECOZ's rulings.

As a self-regulatory body, MECOZ's major strength lies in the fact that it is a "court of honor" rather than a court of law. Kabwe said that MECOZ has not done enough to uphold professional standards in the country. Larry Njungu, executive secretary of the Press Association of Zambia (PAZA), reiterated that the reason for this failure is that "MECOZ is not supported by all."

JOURNALISM MEETS PROFESSIONAL STANDARDS OF QUALITY.

PROFESSIONAL JOURNALISM INDICATORS:

- > Reporting is fair, objective, and well sourced.
- > Journalists follow recognized and accepted ethical standards.
- > Journalists and editors do not practice self-censorship.
- > Journalists cover key events and issues.
- > Pay levels for journalists and other media professionals are sufficiently high to discourage corruption.
- > Entertainment programming does not eclipse news and information programming.
- > Technical facilities and equipment for gathering, producing, and distributing news are modern and efficient.
- > Quality niche reporting and programming exists (investigative, economics/business, local, political).

The number of people who can access the Internet has increased in urban areas. In some provincial centers, the Internet is available but is more expensive than in Lusaka, so the number of people accessing the Internet in these areas is limited.

Summing up what panelists felt was the most significant ethical challenge facing Zambian media, news editor of the commercial Hot FM radio station, Changwe Kabwe, said, "We accept gifts." Phiri elaborated, saying that gifts are very prevalent during coverage of elections, which he felt explained why certain candidates appeared to get more coverage than others. Panelists observed that the practice of receiving gifts for coverage impacted the credibility of the media, resulting in certain sections of the society accusing journalists of being corrupt.

For the indicator dealing with journalists and editors not practicing self-censorship, Djokotoe observed that "self-censorship is real." He added that there was fear of tangling with powerful sources. As discussed above, "brown-envelope journalism" has had an impact on self-censorship because the subjects of unflattering stories can kill the coverage with a bribe.

Regarding whether journalists cover key events and issues, it was noted that journalists do not know what is key. They fail to identify issues worth reporting, and simply report on who has said what. For example, issues dealing with environmental degradation and rising food prices rarely find space in the media unless another news source reports on them.

Panelists observed that there are large discrepancies in the salaries earned by media practitioners but said that these are generally too low to discourage corruption. Salaries ranged from a ZMK 500,000 to ZMK 1.2 million per month (about \$150 to \$360) for both the private and public media houses, although scales at one private newspaper were significantly higher, ranging from ZMK 5 million to ZMK 7 million (\$1500 to \$2100) per month. Pay for media practitioners employed by community media, where a salary of ZMK 500,000 would be high, are especially poor. Generally, media pay is very low, prompting some journalists to solicit payments from sources.

Concerning entertainment versus news and information programming, it was observed that 55 to 60 percent of print media pages is most often reserved for advertisements, and just 40 percent for news and information. Most panelists felt

that more space should be given to news and information content despite issues of financial sustainability.

Even for the electronic media, it was observed that news and information programs are broadcast only at certain times, while more time is allocated to other programming. Recognizing profit motive, Djokotoe observed that "programming is now done in isolation of audience participation." For instance, no audience research surveys are conducted to determine when particular programs should be aired.

Panelists also observed that many media houses are using outdated technologies and equipment for the collection, production and dissemination of news. Media houses are not actively investing in technology, and there is a direct relationship between how recently a media operation was established and how advanced their equipment is—the newer the organization, the more up-to-date their equipment. The cost of replacing outdated or broken equipment is prohibitive for many broadcasters, and older stations often use equipment meant for home use, not commercial broadcasting which has a negative effect on production quality. It was also felt that even when new technology is available, stations are not making optimal use of it due to a lack of training.

OBJECTIVE 3: PLURALITY OF NEWS

Zambia Objective Score: 2.02

This was the second-highest scoring objective for this year's MSI, and only one of two objectives to fall within the near-sustainability bracket despite a small decline compared to last year. The decline came mostly because of drops in the scores of Indicators 2 (citizen access to media), 4 (news agencies), 5 (commercial media produce their own news) and 6 (transparency of media ownership). Balancing this slightly, the panelists revised their assessment of Indicator 3 (state media are nonpartisan and serve the public interest) by awarding a moderately higher score. Indicators 3 and 4 both scored more than a half-point lower than the overall objective average while Indicator 2 scored about three-quarters of a point higher.

Panelists generally felt that citizens do have access to a variety of news sources but that there are significant imbalances between rural and urban areas, with most of the media concentrated in the capital. Two of the three daily newspapers, *The Daily Mail* and *The Post*, are printed in Lusaka. *The Times of Zambia* is printed in Zambia's second-largest city, Ndola. All three try to circulate their

products countrywide, but they reach only provincial centers with a few copies daily—sometimes quite late in the day.

As for broadcasting, only ZNBC radio and television have the capacity to reach the entire country, with some areas still experience problems receiving a signal. Radio Phoenix broadcasts along the rail line from the Southern Province through Lusaka to the Copper Belt. MultiChoice subscription television also has the ability to reach the whole country, but the cost of decoders and subscriptions is prohibitive for most Zambians, especially those in rural areas.

The number of people who can access the Internet has increased in urban areas. In some provincial centers, the Internet is available but is more expensive than in Lusaka, so the number of people accessing the Internet in these areas is limited.

For the indicator regarding a plurality of affordable public and private news sources, it was noted that multiple news sources exist, as evidenced by the number of community media in the country (there are now 34 community radio stations and four community newspapers; there are also three licensed television stations and one private television station currently on test transmission). Subscriptions for both media and the Internet are problematic, however. Newspapers have encouraged people to pay for them in advance for delivery, but this has not worked to their satisfaction. As for Internet services, all of the service providers require upfront payments.

Although community media are available for rural communities, Njungu observed that "there is imbalance in terms of access between rural and urban" communities. The

MULTIPLE NEWS SOURCES PROVIDE CITIZENS WITH RELIABLE AND OBJECTIVE NEWS.

PLURALITY OF NEWS SOURCES INDICATORS:

- > A plurality of affordable public and private news sources (e.g., print, broadcast, Internet) exists.
- > Citizens' access to domestic or international media is not restricted.
- > State or public media reflect the views of the entire political spectrum, are nonpartisan, and serve the public interest.
- Independent news agencies gather and distribute news for print and broadcast media.
- > Independent broadcast media produce their own news programs.
- > Transparency of media ownership allows consumers to judge objectivity of news; media ownership is not concentrated in a few conglomerates.
- A broad spectrum of social interests are reflected and represented in the media, including minority-language information sources.

In a lot of the community media institutions, content and programming is being determined by the people working for the stations without soliciting listener input and participation.

content of the media was also another issue. In a lot of the community media institutions, content and programming is being determined by the people working for the stations without soliciting listener input and participation.

Concerning unrestricted access to domestic or international media, it was agreed that there were no attempts to stop the inflow of foreign media, although the government does block the direct airing of foreign news programs, such as the BBC News, on community media. The government feels that community media should focus on community issues. In fact, the government sometimes uses this argument in the issuance of community media licenses. It insists that community media should broadcast very limited foreign news content, if at all.

Regarding whether state or public media should reflect the views of the entire political spectrum and serve the public interest, it was observed that state broadcaster ZNBC is biased in its coverage and concentrates its attention on government officials. Djokotoe observed that the biggest problem is that "leaders—both media and political—can't distinguish between state and public media." The hierarchical presentation of news starts with what the head of state has done or said, followed by his vice president and then ministers, even if other things have happened that are more newsworthy.

It was observed that there is only one news agency in the country, the Zambia News and Information Service, but Zambian commercial and private media use news services from foreign agencies. Both the BBC and Xhinua, the official Chinese news agency, provide their material to media houses free of change. The stations also use foreign news gleaned from the Internet, although they have not subscribed to these services.

For the indicator regarding whether independent broadcast media produce their own news programs, it was agreed that most did "but can't do good, full-length, documentaries," observed Phiri. This may be because routine news presentations lacking innovation have become so entrenched in news programming.

With the exception of the stations and newspapers owned by the state, there are no other media conglomerates in Zambia. The Competition and Fair Trading Act, which is enforced by the Zambia Competition Commission, prohibits people or

In a lot of the community media institutions, content and programming is being determined by the people working for the stations without soliciting listener input and participation.

companies from owning multiple media platforms. The law also discourages multiple ownership of the same kind of media. One cannot, for example, own two newspapers. In its preamble, the act stipulates that its intention is to, among other things, "encourage competition in the economy by prohibiting anti-competitive trade practices; to regulate monopolies and concentrations of economic power."

Panelists agreed that there is transparency when it comes to ownership. The Registrar of Companies keeps a record of who owns which companies, and this information is freely available on request.

As for the indicator dealing with whether a broad spectrum of social interests are reflected and represented in the media, including minority-language information sources, it was agreed that media do not. This was especially so with issues relating to environmental degradation, poverty, poor sanitation and the high cost of food. In addition, language has been a national issue since the country gained independence in 1964; the official language of the country is English but the country has 73 indigenous dialects. Community media generally broadcast in the majority indigenous languages of the people in the communities in which they operate, but there is resistance to the use of some of the perceived "smaller" languages. For example, on Mazabuka Radio in the Southern Province, only Tonga and English are used on air even though people in the area speak other languages.

OBJECTIVE 4: BUSINESS MANAGEMENT

Zambia Objective Score: 1.40

Business management remained the lowest-scoring objective in the 2008 MSI, and panelists' scores resulted in a drop of 0.55 compared to last year. Nearly all indicators fell to some degree, but most remained within a half-point of the overall score. The exceptions are Indicator 3 (advertising agencies support an advertising market), which was slightly more than half a point higher and Indicator 7 (audience and circulation measurement), which received a score about a point lower.

Regarding whether media outlets and supporting firms are efficient, professionally managed organizations, it was

observed that apart from the printing presses owned by the *Times, Daily Mail* and *The Post,* all printing units were private businesses. This has resulted in high printing costs for media without printing presses.

During the last election in 2006, the government was forced to bail out the two state-owned newspapers—the *Times* and *Daily Mail*—by purchasing vans to help with their distribution.

As for whether private media operate as profit-generating businesses, it was agreed that they do, but this has affected the professional standards of some media houses. Dickson Jere pointed out that at *The Post*, distribution starts very early so the paper must be "put to bed" early, and as such, some breaking stories are held for the next day. Jere added that these operational challenges are affecting the quality of the reporting.

For the indicator dealing with whether media receive revenue from multiple sources, it was observed that the advertising base in Zambia is relatively small but that media houses have developed a number of alternative revenue streams. The ZNBC derives about 80 percent of its revenue from advertising and program sponsorships, while 15 percent comes from television license fees. The corporation also receives capital from the government, but these subventions are not consistent.

Commercial television and radio stations are almost entirely dependent on advertising and program sponsorships, although some stations earn income from SMS initiatives involving partnerships between stations and mobile-phone service providers. Income is generated from listeners and viewers who send SMS messages to stations as a way of participating in discussion programs or transmitting greetings to friends and family. Community stations receive considerably less advertising support but are able to attract funds from donors. Smaller commercial and community stations have been relatively successful in generating advertising from small businesses and service providers who want to reach people within their specific communities.

For both the major state-owned and independent newspapers, revenue is split between advertising and circulation, with the cover price and subscriptions contributing between 20 and 50 percent of newspaper earning. *The Post*, for instance, generates 50 percent of its revenue from copy sales. Some papers, including *The Times* and *The Post*, generate income from providing courier services. Companies and individuals pay a fee to send mail and parcels, among other things, on the vans that distribute newspapers around the country.

Concerning advertising agencies and the advertising market, this was one of the few indicators whose score remained much the same. Panelists reported an increase in the number of entrants into the domestic advertising industry. These emerging agencies provide the link between companies and media houses, with services including both the creative production of advertisements and assisting clients in planning, creating and rolling out campaigns. The market remains small, however, and as Jere observed, "adverts in the country are foreign-driven and foreign-dominated." Local advertising firms have little share of the lucrative creative production of advertisements for large corporations such as MultiChoice, Celtel, MTN and Zambian Breweries. These companies produce their commercials outside the country—mostly in South Africa—and local companies' involvement is limited to securing the placement of advertisements in the media. Panelists observed that international advertising agencies are also opening satellite offices in Zambia to manage advertising planning and placement. Douglas Hampande, a lecturer at Evelyn Hone College, said this trend suggested that there are not enough trained creative production personnel in Zambia.

Panelists discussed whether advertising revenue as a percentage of total revenue was in line with accepted standards at commercial outlets, and agreed that this was the case for some media houses. These included *The Post, The Daily Mail*, and *The Times of Zambia* (for print), and ZNBC Radio and Television, QFM, Phoenix, Muvi TV and Mobi TV (for broadcasting).

Panelists also agreed that independent media do not receive subsidies from the government, although some firms do benefit from preferential treatment in terms of the placement of government advertisements. Small newspapers with a circulation of fewer than 3,000 copies seldom benefit from government advertising. *The Post*, though privately owned, benefits from government advertising because it is

INDEPENDENT MEDIA ARE WELL-MANAGED BUSINESSES, ALLOWING EDITORIAL INDEPENDENCE.

BUSINESS MANAGEMENT INDICATORS:

- > Media outlets and supporting firms operate as efficient, professional, and profit-generating businesses.
- > Media receive revenue from a multitude of sources.
- > Advertising agencies and related industries support an advertising market.
- Advertising revenue as a percentage of total revenue is in line with accepted standards at commercial outlets.
- > Independent media do not receive government subsidies.
- Market research is used to formulate strategic plans, enhance advertising revenue, and tailor products to the needs and interests of audiences.
- > Broadcast ratings and circulation figures are reliably and independently produced.

The ZNBC derives about 80 percent of its revenue from advertising and program sponsorships, while 15 percent comes from television license fees. The corporation also receives capital from the government, but these subventions are not consistent.

the country's highest-circulating newspaper and therefore cannot be ignored because of its reach.

It was generally agreed that formal research is rarely conduced to formulate strategic plans, enhance advertising revenue and tailor products to the needs and interests of audiences. Muvi TV had recently completed an audience survey, however. Media houses do get some feedback in the form of letters to the editor and the monitoring of sales, but these were not considered to be adequate.

Independent research and media monitoring firms including Steadman Research, Ad Track Media Monitoring and Pengolin Consultancy regularly carry out market research. These research firms are mostly commissioned to conduct market research on readership, listenership and viewership by media institutions. The statistics, which include broadcast ratings and circulation figures, are used by media institutions that can afford the research in order to formulate strategic plans to attract advertisers.

Regarding whether broadcast ratings and circulation figures were reliable and independently produced, it was observed that they are not. Even the media houses themselves do not release correct figures.

OBJECTIVE 5: SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS

Zambia Objective Score: 2.20

The score for Objective 5 was the highest of all the objectives again this year, but also suffered the largest drop in score of all five. Only Indicator 4, the quality of academic journalism programs, did not lose ground compared to last year. Panelists generally agreed that there appears to be a balance between the positives and negatives in this area. For instance, it was observed that there are no trade associations for the private media (Indicator 1 scored more than a point-and-a-half below the overall objective score), but there are other associations working for media rights (Indicator 3 scored more than half a point higher than the overall objective score). It was

Information and news distribution channels are plentiful, including television, radio, newspapers, magazines and the Internet. Access to most of these, however, is restricted due to various factors such as expense and reach (with the exception of radio to a slightly better degree).

also noted that although quality media-training institutions exist in the country, the mushrooming of poor colleges with insufficient resources has created problems for the industry as graduates without necessary training enter the market.

Panelists pointed out the existence of 13 professional associations in the country. They include the Zambia Women's Association, Zambia Community Media Forum, Press Freedom Committee of the Post, Society for Zambian Senior Journalists, PAZA, MISA-Zambia, the Commonwealth Press Union Zambian Chapter, and Southern African Editors Forum Zambian Chapter. Membership to these organizations is voluntary. Matibini observed that these organizations are quite vibrant and visible in the lobby for media law reform.

As for the indicator dealing with NGOs supporting free speech and independent media, it was noted that a number of NGOs support media causes, although there was no specialized NGO dedicated to media issues in the country. They include the Nongovernmental Organizations Coordinating Committee, OASIS Forum, National Women's Lobby Group, Churches Council of Zambia, Zambia Episcopal Council, and Zambia Congress of Trade Unions.

SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS FUNCTION IN THE PROFESSIONAL INTERESTS OF INDEPENDENT MEDIA.

SUPPORTING INSTITUTIONS INDICATORS:

- Trade associations represent the interests of private media owners and provide member services.
- > Professional associations work to protect journalists' rights.
- > NGOs support free speech and independent media.
- > Quality journalism degree programs that provide substantial practical experience exist.
- > Short-term training and in-service training programs allow journalists to upgrade skills or acquire new skills.
- > Sources of newsprint and printing facilities are in private hands, applitical, and unrestricted.
- > Channels of media distribution (kiosks, transmitters, Internet) are private, apolitical, and unrestricted.

Regarding the existence of quality journalism degree programs that provide substantial practical experience, it was noted that the University of Zambia, Department of Mass Communication offers four quality degree programs. It offers one undergraduate program, the bachelor of mass communication; two master's programs, the master of mass communication and the master of communication for development; and a doctorate program. In addition, studies abroad are also available to supplement the local program.

Hampande observed, however, that the training of some "journalists" in substandard institutions has affected overall journalism standards in the country. He expressed the need for short-term training in the areas of online journalism, community media broadcasting as well as general management and business skills.

It was observed that short-term training and in-service training programs allowing journalists to or acquire new skills have existed for a long time through the Zambia Institute of Mass Communication (ZAMCOM) Educational Trust. In addition, international organizations such as the Nordic/SADCC Journalism Centre are available to offer this type of training. Henry Kabwe expressed misgiving saying, "Masquerading (as journalists) has increased as a result of short courses" because some people attend one- or two-week journalism workshops and believe they are properly trained.

The panelists also noted that the orientation change by ZAMCOM has had a big impact on the number of short-term and in-service training courses being offered by the institution. Like Evelyn Hone College, ZAMCOM now offers a three-year, full-time diploma qualification.

Concerning private, apolitical and unrestricted sources of newsprint and printing facilities, it was observed that newsprint is bought directly from Zimbabwe and South Africa by the main newspaper houses in the country (*The Times of Zambia, The Zambia Daily Mail* and *The Post*). These three also own their printing presses. *The National Mirror, Monitor, Guardian* and *Southern Guardian* newspapers also own their own printing presses.

For the indicator dealing with private, apolitical and unrestricted channels of media distribution, it was noted that there is no state control in this area. Each newspaper, for instance, manages its own distribution and all broadcast media have their own transmitters. Information and news distribution channels are plentiful, including television, radio, newspapers, magazines and the Internet. Access to most of these, however, is restricted due to various factors such as expense and reach (with the exception of radio to a slightly better degree).

List of Panel Participants

Changwe Kabwe, news editor, Hot FM Radio Station, Lusaka

Larry Njungu, executive secretary, Press Association of Zambia, Lusaka

Edem Djokotoe, managing consultant, Primus Media, Lusaka

Dickson Jere, media consultant, Brentwood Public Affairs, Lusaka

Henry Kabwe, chairperson, Media Institute of Southern Africa-Zambia, Lusaka

Mukeya Liwena, station manager, Radio Lyambai, Mongu

Masautso Phiri, freelance media consultant, Lusaka

Patrick Matibini, managing partner, Pat Mat Legal Practitioners, Lusaka

Albert Mwiinga, station manager, Mazabuka Radio, Mazabuka

Douglas Hampande, lecturer, Evelyn Hone College, Lusaka

The following participant submitted a questionnaire but did not attend the panel discussion.

John Kamwanga, station manager, FCC Radio, Solwezi

Moderator

Kenny Makungu, senior lecturer, University of Zambia, Lusaka

Observer

Brian Lingela, broadcasting and information manager, Media Institute of Southern Africa-Zambia, Lusaka

The Zambia study was coordinated by, and conducted in partnership with, the Sol Plaatje Institute for Media Leadership, Rhodes University, Grahamstown, South Africa